

FIRST-TIER TRIBUNAL PROPERTY CHAMBER (RESIDENTIAL PROPERTY)

Case Reference

: LON/00BB/LSC/2015/0517

Property

Flat 5 Charlton Court High Street South East Ham London E6 6JD

Applicant

Grand Globe Ventures Limited

Representatives

Dutton Gregory

Respondent

Ms Adeola Ajediti

Representative

Type of Application

Reasonableness of and liability for service charges and administration

charges under the Landlord and

Tenant Act 1985

Tribunal Members

Prof Robert M. Abbey (Solicitor)

Date and venue of Paper Based Decision 15th March 2016 at 10 Alfred Place,

London WC1E 7LR

Date of Decision

15th March 2016

DECISION

Decisions of the tribunal

1. The Tribunal determines that as at the date when the county court proceedings were issued by the applicant there was payable by the respondent to the applicant:

Service charges years 2011-2014

Unpaid service charges for the above service charge years £6296.39

- 2. The file shall be returned to the County Court at Bow for the determination of the following claims which this tribunal does not have jurisdiction to determine:
 - o Court fee and
 - o Costs
- 3. The reasons for our decisions are set out below.

The application and procedural background

- 4. In November of 2014 the applicant landlord commenced legal proceedings against the respondent as proprietor of a long lease of the subject property.
- 5. The respondent did file a defence which asserted that the Respondent was not liable because she said she was entitled to a detailed breakdown of the claimed service charges.
- 6. The applicant's claim concerning the determination of service charges referenced A71YP316 was transferred to this tribunal by order of District Judge Bell from the County Court at Bow. The date of the order was 10 December 2015. The claim made in the county court was for unpaid service charges.
- 1. The relevant legal provisions are set out in the Appendix to this decision.

The hearing

2. There was no oral hearing. Judge Angus Andrew on 23rd February 2016 issued a decision and further directions whereby the respondent was barred from taking any further part in these proceedings. Subsequently the applicant's representatives submitted to the tribunal an admission form signed by the respondent that authorised her mortgagees to pay the arrears which she acknowledged were due and payable as service charges under the terms of the lease of the property.

The background

- 3. The respondent holds a long lease of the property which requires the landlord to provide services and the tenant to contribute towards their costs by way of a variable service charge.
- 4. The landlord applicant claimed service charges of £6296.39 for the years 2011 through to 2014. It is this sum that is in dispute and is the item referred to the tribunal by Judge Bell.

The service charges claimed

- 5. Having read evidence and submissions from the parties and considered all of the documents provided, the tribunal determines the issue as follows.
- 6. In regard to the claimed service charges being in mind the written admission issued by the respondent and the direction made Judge Andrew the tribunal finds that the service charges claimed are reasonable and payable by the respondent.
- 7. Therefore with regard to the service charges the tribunal was satisfied that these were reasonable and proportionate given the nature of the claim and the admission. The tribunal therefore decided that the service charges of £6296.39 were payable by the Respondent.

Transfer back to the county court

8. There were some claims made in the court proceedings which we do not have jurisdiction to determine. We have therefore transferred the file back to the county court so that these claims may be pursued if the applicant wishes to do so.

Name:

Judge Professor Robert

M. Abbey

Date:

15 March 2016

Appendix of relevant legislation

Landlord and Tenant Act 1985 (as amended)

Section 18

- (1) In the following provisions of this Act "service charge" means an amount payable by a tenant of a dwelling as part of or in addition to the rent -
 - (a) which is payable, directly or indirectly, for services, repairs, maintenance, improvements or insurance or the landlord's costs of management, and
 - (b) the whole or part of which varies or may vary according to the relevant costs.
- (2) The relevant costs are the costs or estimated costs incurred or to be incurred by or on behalf of the landlord, or a superior landlord, in connection with the matters for which the service charge is payable.
- (3) For this purpose -
 - (a) "costs" includes overheads, and
 - (b) costs are relevant costs in relation to a service charge whether they are incurred, or to be incurred, in the period for which the service charge is payable or in an earlier or later period.

Section 19

- (1) Relevant costs shall be taken into account in determining the amount of a service charge payable for a period -
 - (a) only to the extent that they are reasonably incurred, and
 - (b) where they are incurred on the provisions of services or the carrying out of works, only if the services or works are of a reasonable standard;
 - and the amount payable shall be limited accordingly.
- (2) Where a service charge is payable before the relevant costs are incurred, no greater amount than is reasonable is so payable, and after the relevant costs have been incurred any necessary adjustment shall be made by repayment, reduction or subsequent charges or otherwise.

Section 27A

- (1) An application may be made to the appropriate tribunal for a determination whether a service charge is payable and, if it is, as to
 - (a) the person by whom it is payable,
 - (b) the person to whom it is payable,
 - (c) the amount which is payable,

- (d) the date at or by which it is payable, and
- (e) the manner in which it is payable.
- (2) Subsection (1) applies whether or not any payment has been made.
- (3) An application may also be made to the appropriate tribunal for a determination whether, if costs were incurred for services, repairs, maintenance, improvements, insurance or management of any specified description, a service charge would be payable for the costs and, if it would, as to -
 - (a) the person by whom it would be payable,
 - (b) the person to whom it would be payable,
 - (c) the amount which would be payable,
 - (d) the date at or by which it would be payable, and
 - (e) the manner in which it would be payable.
- (4) No application under subsection (1) or (3) may be made in respect of a matter which -
 - (a) has been agreed or admitted by the tenant,
 - (b) has been, or is to be, referred to arbitration pursuant to a post-dispute arbitration agreement to which the tenant is a party,
 - (c) has been the subject of determination by a court, or
 - (d) has been the subject of determination by an arbitral tribunal pursuant to a post-dispute arbitration agreement.
- (5) But the tenant is not to be taken to have agreed or admitted any matter by reason only of having made any payment.

Section 20C

- (1) A tenant may make an application for an order that all or any of the costs incurred, or to be incurred, by the landlord in connection with proceedings before a court, residential property tribunal or the Upper Tribunal, or in connection with arbitration proceedings, are not to be regarded as relevant costs to be taken into account in determining the amount of any service charge payable by the tenant or any other person or persons specified in the application.
- (2) The application shall be made—
 - (a) in the case of court proceedings, to the court before which the proceedings are taking place or, if the application is made after the proceedings are concluded, to a county court;
 - (aa) in the case of proceedings before a residential property tribunal, to that tribunal;
 - (b) in the case of proceedings before a residential property tribunal, to the tribunal before which the proceedings are taking place or, if the application is made after the proceedings are concluded, to any residential property tribunal;

- (c) in the case of proceedings before the Upper Tribunal, to the tribunal;
- (d) in the case of arbitration proceedings, to the arbitral tribunal or, if the application is made after the proceedings are concluded, to a county court.
- (3) The court or tribunal to which the application is made may make such order on the application as it considers just and equitable in the circumstances.

Commonhold and Leasehold Reform Act 2002 Schedule 11

Administration charges

Part 1 Reasonableness of administration charges

Meaning of "administration charge"

1(1)In this Part of this Schedule "administration charge" means an amount payable by a tenant of a dwelling as part of or in addition to the rent which is payable, directly or indirectly—

(a) for or in connection with the grant of approvals under his lease, or applications for such approvals,

(b) for or in connection with the provision of information or documents by or on behalf of the landlord or a person who is party to his lease otherwise than as landlord or tenant,

(c)in respect of a failure by the tenant to make a payment by the due date to the landlord or a person who is party to his lease otherwise than as landlord or tenant, or

(d)in connection with a breach (or alleged breach) of a covenant or condition in his lease.

(2) But an amount payable by the tenant of a dwelling the rent of which is registered under Part 4 of the Rent Act 1977 (c. 42) is not an administration charge, unless the amount registered is entered as a variable amount in pursuance of section 71(4) of that Act.

(3)In this Part of this Schedule "variable administration charge" means an administration charge payable by a tenant which is neither—

(a) specified in his lease, nor

(b)calculated in accordance with a formula specified in his lease. (4)An order amending sub-paragraph (1) may be made by the appropriate national authority.

Reasonableness of administration charges

2 A variable administration charge is payable only to the extent that the amount of the charge is reasonable.

3(1)Any party to a lease of a dwelling may apply to a leasehold valuation tribunal for an order varying the lease in such manner as is specified in the application on the grounds that—

(a) any administration charge specified in the lease is unreasonable, or (b) any formula specified in the lease in accordance with which any administration charge is calculated is unreasonable.

- (2)If the grounds on which the application was made are established to the satisfaction of the tribunal, it may make an order varying the lease in such manner as is specified in the order.
- (3) The variation specified in the order may be—
 - (a) the variation specified in the application, or
 - (b) such other variation as the tribunal thinks fit.
- (4) The tribunal may, instead of making an order varying the lease in such manner as is specified in the order, make an order directing the parties to the lease to vary it in such manner as is so specified.
- (5) The tribunal may by order direct that a memorandum of any variation of a lease effected by virtue of this paragraph be endorsed on such documents as are specified in the order.
- (6)Any such variation of a lease shall be binding not only on the parties to the lease for the time being but also on other persons (including any predecessors in title), whether or not they were parties to the proceedings in which the order was made.

Notice in connection with demands for administration charges 4(1)A demand for the payment of an administration charge must be accompanied by a summary of the rights and obligations of tenants of dwellings in relation to administration charges.

- (2)The appropriate national authority may make regulations prescribing requirements as to the form and content of such summaries of rights and obligations.
- (3)A tenant may withhold payment of an administration charge which has been demanded from him if sub-paragraph (1) is not complied with in relation to the demand.
- (4) Where a tenant withholds an administration charge under this paragraph, any provisions of the lease relating to non-payment or late payment of administration charges do not have effect in relation to the period for which he so withholds it.

Liability to pay administration charges

- 5(1)An application may be made to a leasehold valuation tribunal for a determination whether an administration charge is payable and, if it is, as to—
 - (a)the person by whom it is payable,
 - (b) the person to whom it is payable,
 - (c) the amount which is payable,
 - (d) the date at or by which it is payable, and
 - (e)the manner in which it is payable.
- (2)Sub-paragraph (1) applies whether or not any payment has been made.
- (3)The jurisdiction conferred on a leasehold valuation tribunal in respect of any matter by virtue of sub-paragraph (1) is in addition to any jurisdiction of a court in respect of the matter.
- (4)No application under sub-paragraph (1) may be made in respect of a matter which—
 - (a) has been agreed or admitted by the tenant,
 - (b)has been, or is to be, referred to arbitration pursuant to a post-
 - dispute arbitration agreement to which the tenant is a party,
 - (c) has been the subject of determination by a court, or

(d)has been the subject of determination by an arbitral tribunal pursuant to a post-dispute arbitration agreement.

(5) But the tenant is not to be taken to have agreed or admitted any matter by

reason only of having made any payment.

- (6)An agreement by the tenant of a dwelling (other than a post-dispute arbitration agreement) is void in so far as it purports to provide for a determination—
 - (a)in a particular manner, or
- (b)on particular evidence, of any question which may be the subject matter of an application under subparagraph (1).